



Eating Shalosh Seudot on Shabbat Erev Pesach - Part I

When Erev Pesach coincides with Shabbat, the normal pre-Pesach routine is altered as many of its preparations and practices cannot be performed on Shabbat. Yet, this uncommon occurrence doesn't only cause Shabbat to affect the pre-Pesach preparations, but Erev Pesach has an effect on Shabbat as well. One of the mainstays of Shabbat is that three meals are eaten- one on Friday night, one on Shabbat morning, and one on Shabbat afternoon. However, there are three *halachot* relevant to Erev Pesach that force us to shift from the normal Shabbat routine and find new ways to fulfill the mitzvah of eating three meals on Shabbat. First, there is a prohibition to eat chametz after the fourth hour of the day. Second, the Talmud Yerushalmi, *Pesachim* 10:1, states that there is a prohibition to eat matzah. Third, the Mishna, *Pesachim* 99b, states that from the time of Mincha until nightfall, it is prohibited to eat a meal. Therefore, eating the third meal in the late afternoon is ostensibly off-limits. If one wants to eat the meal in the early afternoon, he may do so, but with one technical problem: he cannot eat chametz or matzah. Eating a third meal of chametz before the fourth hour might not be an option either as the third meal is supposed to be eaten in the afternoon.

Compounding this halachic conflict is a practical conflict. Once Shabbat starts, the means of disposing of chametz are severely limited. Thus, many households would prefer not to have any chametz in their possession before the Erev Pesach Shabbat. Therefore, in dealing with solutions to eating the third meal, one must also find solutions for those who have a self-imposed prohibition of chametz starting at sundown on Friday night. This article will explore the possibilities of eating the third meal when Erev Pesach coincides with Shabbat, as well as eating all three meals for those who prefer not to eat chametz on this day.

The Prohibition of Eating Matzah on Erev Pesach

Do all types of matzah fall under the prohibition of eating matzah on Erev Pesach? Tosafot, *Pesachim* 99b, s.v. *Lo*, question the nature of the prohibition to eat a meal before the time of Mincha. At that time, it is prohibited to eat chametz and it is prohibited to eat matzah. It is permitted at that time to eat non-grain items. If so, what is the need for such a prohibition. Tosafot claim that the prohibition restricts eating a meal of *matzah ashirah*, rich matzah. Tosafot explain that the only type of matzah that is prohibited on Erev Pesach is matzah that one can use to fulfill the mitzvah on Pesach. The Gemara, *Pesachim* 36a, states that one cannot fulfill the mitzvah of eating matzah with *matzah ashirah* and therefore Tosafot allow eating it Erev Pesach.

What is *matzah ashirah*? *Matzah Ashirah* is matzah whose ingredients include liquids other than water. The Gemara, *ibid*, mentions wine, oil, honey, and milk as examples. Rambam, *Hilchot Chametz UMatzah* 6:5, writes that one cannot fulfill the mitzvah of matzah using matzah whose dough was kneaded with wine, oil, honey, or

milk. However, if the dough was kneaded with fruit juices, one may fulfill the mitzvah of matzah with it. *Beit Yosef, Orach Chaim* 462, writes that he does not know of any other authority who agrees with Rambam regarding fruit juices. He believes that all other authorities disallow the use of matzah containing fruit juice for the mitzvah of matzah. Likewise, in *Shulchan Aruch, Orach Chaim* 462:1, it states that one may not fulfill the mitzvah of matzah with matzah that was kneaded with anything other than water. Nevertheless, it is possible that the ruling of *Shulchan Aruch* disallowing all non-water matzahs may be a matter of stringency. One cannot claim definitively that one does not fulfill the mitzvah with matzah containing fruit juice. Therefore, on Erev Pesach where the objective is to eat a type of matzah that one cannot use to fulfill the mitzvah, one should obtain a matzah kneaded with wine, oil, or honey. [Matzah kneaded with milk poses other halachic difficulties, see *Yoreh De'ah* ch. 96.] "White grape matzah" would then be the preferred choice over egg matzah. [See however, *Igrot Moshe, Orach Chaim* 1:155, who permits egg matzah on Erev Pesach.]

Matzah Ashirah would seem to be the perfect solution to the problem. After all, it is not matzah, it is not chametz, and yet one can recite *hamotzi* on it, and use it for the Shabbat meals. In fact, *Shulchan Aruch, Orach Chaim* 444:1, recommends using *matzah ashirah* for the third Shabbat meal. *Matzah ashirah* would also be useful to those who don't want to have chametz in their possession on Shabbat. One can use the *matzah ashirah* for all three meals without worrying about finishing the meal before the final time to eat chametz.

However, this solution is not totally viable according to Ashkenazic tradition. *Rama, Orach Chaim* 462:4, writes that Ashkenazic tradition, as an added precaution to the prohibition of chametz, does not allow the use of *matzah ashirah* the entire Pesach except for the ill and the elderly. Therefore, when *Shulchan Aruch* writes that one should fulfill the third Shabbat meal with *matzah ashirah*, *Rama* writes "in our lands where it is not the practice to eat *matzah ashirah* as stated below (462:4) in the glosses, one should fulfill the third meal with fruit, meat or fish." [See *Aruch HaShulchan, Orach Chaim* 444:3, who claims that the tradition to disallow *matzah ashirah* only applies on Pesach proper. On Erev Pesach it is permitted to eat *matzah ashirah* even according to Ashkenazic tradition. *Rama* does not disallow the use of *matzah ashirah*, he is merely offering an alternative in lands where the tradition is not to eat *matzah ashirah* and therefore it not readily available. If it is available, *Rama* would certainly allow and recommend its use.]

Other Types of Matzah

A number of Acharonim suggest an alternative to *matzah ashirah* or fruits. The Gemara, *Pesachim* 41a, quotes R. Yosi that one cannot fulfill the mitzvah of matzah with cooked matzah. Tosafot, ad loc., s.v. *Aval*, write that cooked matzah retains its status as bread but it loses its status as matzah that can be used for the mitzvah, similar to *matzah ashirah*. *Magen Avraham* 444:2, and *Shulchan Aruch HaGraz* 441:4, suggest that cooked matzah would be a perfectly valid means of fulfilling the third Shabbat meal, as one cannot fulfill the mitzvah of matzah with it, and therefore one may eat it on Erev Pesach. Nevertheless they write that there is no tradition to follow this suggestion. R. Ovadia Yosef, *Yabia Omer, Orach Chaim* 6:39, quotes some authorities who include cooked matzah in the prohibition to eat matzah on Erev Pesach. However, he personally

permits such a practice.

Meiri, *Pesachim* 99b, suggests another alternative to *matzah ashirah*. The Gemara, *Pesachim* 40a, states that in order to fulfill the mitzvah of matzah, one must make the matzah for the purpose of fulfilling the mitzvah. Meiri contends that matzah that was not made for the purpose of fulfilling the mitzvah may be eaten on Erev Pesach. R. Ya'akov B. Zolty, *Mishnat Ya'avetz, Orach Chaim* 16:5, adopts Meiri's opinion as a practical suggestion for eating three Shabbat meals on Erev Pesach. R. Ovadia Yosef, *Yechaveh Da'at* 3:26, allows one to eat such matzah on Erev Pesach in a pressing situation. R. Yitzchak Weiss, *Minchat Yitzchak* 8:37, rules that it is absolutely prohibited to eat this type of matzah on Erev Pesach. It should be noted that in order to utilize Meiri's suggestion, one would have to commission a special baking of matzah made specifically not be used for the mitzvah as all "Kosher for Pesach" matzah is made for the purpose of fulfilling the mitzvah.

Fulfillment of Seudah Shlishit with Fruits, Meat, or Fish

Rama's recommendation to fulfill the third Shabbat meal with fruit, meat or fish, is not universally accepted. There is a dispute among the Rishonim whether one can fulfill the third Shabbat meal with *minei targima*, various appetizers. Tosafot, *Sukkah* 27a, s.v. *B'Minei*, rule that one cannot fulfill the third meal of Shabbat with these appetizers. Rabbeinu Yonah, *Berachot* 36b, s.v. *Birkat* rules that one may fulfill the third Shabbat meal with appetizers. There is a further dispute as to what is included in these appetizers. Rashi, *Sukkah* 27a, s.v. *B'Minei*, writes that it refers to fruits and desserts. Tosafot, *ibid*, write that it refers to meat and fish. Rosh, *Sukkah* 2:13, writes that it refers to grain products. *Shulchan Aruch, Orach Chaim* 291:5, writes that one should not rely on the opinion that one may fulfill the third Shabbat meal with fruits, meat or fish, unless one has no other option. Therefore *Rama's* stringency to disallow *matzah ashirah* compromises the mitzvah to eat three Shabbat meals.

The Weekly Halacha Overview, by Rabbi Josh Flug, is a service of YUTORAH, the online source of the Torah of Yeshiva University. Get more halacha shiurim and thousands of other shiurim, by visiting www.yutorah.org.