

MARC B. SHAPIRO

---

## *Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch and Friedrich von Schiller*

Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch's philosophy of *Torah im Derekh Erez* finds expression in many texts, and these have been available in English for many years. The one exception is his famous speech about the Romantic poet, dramatist and historian Friedrich von Schiller (1759-1805), which until now has not been translated into any language from its original German.<sup>1</sup> The reasons for the absence of a translation are not hard to see. For one, R. Hirsch's attachment to Schiller has not been shared by more recent generations. Especially in the post-Holocaust years, R. Hirsch's great attachment to German culture would have been very painful for many to see. Also significant is the fact that a great rabbi could find such spiritual value in writings outside of the canon of Torah literature. As R. Hirsch's position in this matter is so far removed from contemporary Orthodox culture, it has been easier to ignore what he said, rather than try to come to terms with it.<sup>2</sup>

What did R. Hirsch find so significant in Schiller? Eliyahu Meir Klugman answers as follows:

Rabbi Hirsch saw in Schiller noble expressions of compassion, justice and human decency, a purity of spirit, a freewilled obedience to the Divine imperative, and an attempt to see the wonders of the Creator in every facet of Nature. Rabbi Hirsch viewed the popularity of Schiller's writings as a sign that these ideals were on the ascendant. The joyful affir-

---

MARC B. SHAPIRO holds the Weinberg Chair in Judaic Studies at the University of Scranton. His most recent book is *Studies in Maimonides and His Interpreters*.

mation of life, the attempt to reveal the wonders of creation and family, and the equality of all men were Jewish ideals which, hopefully, were slowly being accepted by mankind.<sup>3</sup>

R. Hirsch's appreciation of Schiller is part and parcel of a philosophy that embraced the positive aspects of general, and in particular, German, culture. True culture contains universal, and thus Jewish, truths, and these should be part of the Jewish *Weltanschauung*. In the words of Mordechai Breuer: "The Jew as human being could incorporate such German cultural values into his Jewish education unreservedly, not only as a component of his social and civic training but as a way of thinking and as a spiritual course, in essence related to Judaism."<sup>4</sup> This last point, that the classics of literature can have spiritual value, is of great importance, and is also stressed elsewhere in R. Hirsch's writings.<sup>5</sup>

While Schiller was central for the Orthodox of R. Hirsch's day (and this included R. Hirsch's wife Johanna<sup>6</sup>), his appeal declined in subsequent generations, especially as many turned to the writings of Johann von Goethe (1749-1832).<sup>7</sup> However, until the tragic end of German Orthodoxy there remained pockets of lovers of Schiller.<sup>8</sup> Not surprisingly, when the German Orthodox and Hirschian educator, Leo Deutschlander, developed the curriculum for the Polish Bais Yaakov schools, he included German instruction. His goal was that the teachers should be able "to read by themselves the important religious literature of Hirsch," as well as classic secular German works, including Schiller.<sup>9</sup> Yet Schiller or no Schiller, what was crucial for followers of R. Hirsch was the firmly held conviction that great works of secular literature can often teach lessons fully compatible with authentic Torah teachings, and these writings are therefore to be identified as "*Derekh Erez*." This was to remain a distinctive feature of the Hirschian philosophy.

R. Hirsch's speech follows in translation.

## A Speech

**Delivered at the Celebration of the Israelitischen Religionsgesellschaft's  
School in Frankfurt am Main on November 9, 1859  
on the Eve of the Schiller Festival**

by

**Samson Raphael Hirsch,  
Rabbi of the Israelitischen Gesellschaft and Headmaster of the School  
(based on a stenographic record)**

• • • • •

If the genius would step into our midst, of whose legacy our young friends<sup>10</sup> have just presented a few sparse echoes to us, and, my friends, if we as Jews and Jewesses met Schiller, then the wisdom of our fathers would instruct us to greet him with the saying: ברוך שנתן מחכמתו לבשר דום, “Blessing and praise to him who has imparted of His wisdom to mortals.”<sup>11</sup> After all, did not the wisdom of our fathers teach us to stand still wherever we encounter splendor and greatness, severity and delight, deep affection and grace, and to look up to the One who sends splendor and greatness, delight and severity into our realm. This is just as our fathers have accustomed us to lift up our eyes to Him whenever a ray of light greets us, spring perfumes the air, lightning flashes through the clouds, and when He causes rolling thunder to shake the earth. [We look] to Him who spreads out the light, sends lightning, orders the course of the year, and causes fragrant blossoms to arise from the dark womb of the earth. Thus, the wisdom of our Sages has taught us to stand still, especially when we encounter the greatest blooming and wisdom produced in mortals. In such a case, the wisdom of our Sages does not inquire about their lineage or tribal affiliation, nor their faith or the color of their skin. Wherever someone encounters a wise man, enveloped in the splendor and light of wisdom, she looks up to the One who gave wisdom to mortals as a gift, and who has endowed “the gift of His wisdom” through the wisdom of mortals. She thus reflects on Him who has planted this soul and produced this mind, who already in early childhood kept watch over the seeds germinating in this soul and mind that would bring happiness and enlighten mankind in times to come, and who caused the youngster and the man to mature in the presence of such formative, cleansing, and strengthening powers, so that his wisdom is now enlightening and delighting mankind everywhere.

They therefore called human wisdom *מחכמתו*, a gift of His wisdom. This wisdom, which is a reflection of the glory of God on earth, acknowledges everything that is truly good and beautiful, everything that enlightens human minds, all that paves the way for truth to reach into the heart of mortals, and whatever makes souls receptive to beauty. Our Sages teach that whatever imparts greater wisdom to humans, and whatever makes them happier and better people, is derived from *חכמתו*, from His wisdom! The wisdom of mortals is a reflection of His wisdom. From the lips of mortals reverberates His spirit. *ברוך שנתן מחכמתו לבשר ודם*, they teach and bless the One who has endowed mortals from His wisdom.

Who could be more worthy of this welcome with eyes that are lifted to God, whom could our Sages welcome with more joy than the man to whose memory this hour is consecrated? At this moment, this man, whom Germany so proudly calls “her” Schiller, is celebrated all over the world where our native tongue is understood, where German soul and spirit are manifest. News of his songs and poems has even reached beyond the realm of the German language. Our fathers would possibly be the only sages on earth who would direct such a man firstly to the One to whom everything belongs that is truly good and beautiful, that which Schiller felt in his heart and envisioned in his soul, that which truly enlightens and refines men. The heart-moving sound of his poems still inspires hearts and spirits, after his mortal remains have been covered by a grave for so long, uniting at this very moment so many millions of souls in the joyous awareness that a Schiller was born a hundred years ago!

Above all, our Sages would praise the gift of *מחכמתו*, the gift of divine wisdom, in Schiller’s intellect and talent. Schiller is not cherished by the world for discovering heavenly spheres, nor for exploring the earth’s depths. The genius to whom this hour is consecrated aspired, through his expressions, feelings, and intellectual creations, to the most beautiful, divine thoughts. It was man, in his most humane and divine, which found expression in the person of Schiller. Therefore, at this moment millions of souls on earth are standing still and rejoicing that such a spirit was born to them, because this mind’s song on earth was consecrated to the pure, the humane, and the divine. In this, the human regains its better self, that which raises it above the common, immoral, and unworthy. These souls are standing still and rejoicing, since his life’s song was consecrated to a free spirit, a noble mind, to morals and virtue, to liberty within the law and to the law in liberty. [They stand still] because Schiller’s song resounded with contemplation of the eter-

nal One who greets every philosopher in the shape of a flower next to the path, and in every stirring of the heart. [They stand still] because in Schiller's songs we encounter man in his dignity, and humanity is transformed and perfected on every level and in every situation through the purity of its divine destiny. Schiller mirrors humanity's eternal noble rank to us all, to boys and girls, young men and women, wives and husbands, older men and women, princes and beggars. Every one of them feels and happily gains awareness while listening to his songs. They rediscover their own feelings and thoughts, their own eternal image is regained in brilliance and purity. His songs have ennobled human beings in the minds of men, raised them up and consecrated them, and presented their image in glory.

Who understood as well as Schiller how to so beautifully express truths that can save the world and men, words that cling to and win over soul and mind? Who else understood so well how to sing of liberty, virtue, and of words of faith in God, which still make men rejoice nowadays and within which they find their own holiest thoughts expressed?

Who was able to enter, as he did, into the family circle and praise the woman and spouse, as well as domestic life and happiness, in their dignity and great importance, and in their blissful intimacy? Who understood as well as Schiller how to sing from the heartfelt depths of the infinite and eternal, of the lofty eternal goal that is the calling of humanity, that which every man should aspire to? Who else sang more formidably and enthusiastically of these ideals?

Who else saw in the weightiness of history the way of mankind's divinely ordained education? Who else dared to create images in plain view for people to see, identifying the oppression of tyrants as being rooted in their powerlessness, [showing] justice and humanity as forces that will remain eternally victorious, admonishing the tyrant that power is never assured, but rather that justice will win in the end? Who else understood as well as Schiller to present a flower to each in his own place, whether humble or great, allowing everyone to attach their hopes and dreams to it, and to consecrate and raise awareness of each moment in life?

Since, above all, Schiller's work so alluringly resounded and appealed to the moral elevation of mankind, there is no sage among the nations to whom our Sages would rather have bound a wreath of homage than to him.

Indeed, they would have greeted Schiller as one of their own, and would have recognized only familiar tones among his sounds.

From where did the thoughts arise—consciously or unconsciously—that have, above all, made Schiller the poet of the nations? Whose views and truths have, above all, won over the minds of men to Schiller? Is not his song, which is resounding in the hearts of the German people, based especially on Jewish thoughts and views, and [has not] the entire German people now arisen to welcome Schiller with jubilation of heart because of this?

While on earth, man is regarded as the most exalted. Schiller invites all, no matter what their ability, to rejoice when he summons us enthusiastically with song of joy:

As through heaven's expanse so glorious  
 In their orbits suns roll on,  
 Brethren, thus your proud race run,  
 Glad as warriors all-victorious

When he calls out to us:

Mortals, meekly wait for heaven  
 Suffer on in patient love!  
 In the starry realms above,  
 Bright rewards by God are given.

OR:

In the starry realms above,  
 God will mete as we may measure . . .

Courage, ne'er by sorrow broken!  
 Aid where tears of virtue flow;  
 Faith to keep each promise spoken!  
 Truth alike to friend and foe!  
 'Neath kings' frowns a manly spirit!—  
 Brethren, noble is the prize—  
 Honor due to every merit!  
 Death to all the brood of lies!<sup>12</sup>

When he leads us out from the sphere of the finite and shows us the Eternal in His might, and makes us hear His voice through nature:

"Creatures, do ye acknowledge me?"  
 Spare us, Lord! We acknowledge Thee!<sup>13</sup>

OR:

Was't not foreshadowed in his dream  
 Whose eyes explored you starry field.<sup>14</sup>

When he leads us to a plant, to teach us what is most important:

What it unwittingly is, be thou of thine own free will!<sup>15</sup>

Or when he knows how to lift us with words above all of life's pain and ordeals:

Abstain, who faith can learn!  
 The world's long story is the world's own doom  
 Hope thou has felt,—thy wages, then, are paid;  
 Thy faith 'twas formed the rapture pledged to thee.  
 Thou might'st have of the wise inquiry made,—  
 The minutes thou neglectest, as they fade,  
 Are given back by no eternity!<sup>16</sup>

Consider when, in these few words, Schiller sings of bliss imparted through every minute in life spent in conscious and faithful pursuit of, and in privation and suffering for, a higher end; when he said that those who don't know how to taste bliss even in the most destitute and unhappy minute filled with privation, through what Schiller's tradition calls a heart filled with faith, would not be able to fully experience eternal bliss—after all, the bliss each earthly minute should impart to a faith-filled heart can hardly be equal to the bliss afforded by eternity; when he sings of liberty, virtue, and God:

Man is made free!—Man by birthright is free . . .  
 Still fear not the slave, when he breaks from his chain,  
 For the man made a freeman grows safe in his gain.

And virtue is more than a shade or a sound,  
 And man may her voice, in this being, obey;  
 And though ever he slip on the stony ground,  
 Yet ever again to the godlike way . . .

And a God there is!—over space, over time,  
 While the human will rocks, like a reed, to and fro,  
 Lives the will of the holy—a purpose sublime,  
 A thought woven over creation below;  
 Changing and shifting the all we inherit,  
 But changeless through all one immutable spirit!<sup>17</sup>

When he leads us into the domestic circle and sings of the dignity of women, such as:

Woman, the soft one, persuasively prayeth—  
 Of the life that she charmeth, the sceptre she swayeth,  
 She lulls, as she looks from above,

The discord whose hell for its victims is gaping,  
And blending awhile the forever escaping,  
Whispers hate to the image of love!<sup>18</sup>

When he sings about childhood, youth, marriage, men's diligence, and domestic happiness, such as:

The mother-love's untiring care!  
And swift the years like arrows fly . . .

No more with girls content to play,  
Bounds the proud boy upon his way . . .

So be it with thee, if forever united,  
The heart to the heart flows in one, love delighted . . .

Love lingers lonely,  
When passion is mute . . .

The husband must enter  
The hostile life,  
With struggle and strife  
To plant or to watch . . .

One human glance of grief upon the grave  
Of all that fortune gave  
The loiterer takes—then turns him to depart,  
And grasps the wanderer's staff and mans his heart:  
Whatever else the element bereaves  
One blessing more than all it left—it leaves,  
The faces that he loves!—He counts them o'er,  
See—not one look is missing from that store! . . .

When he enters the domain of government and praises its holy order, such as:

Bliss dowered! O daughter of the skies,  
Hail, holy order, whose employ  
blends like to like in light and joy . . .  
Each in his rights can each revere,  
And while they march in freedom's van  
Scorn the lewd rout that dogs the rear . . .  
Kings glory in the orb and crown—  
Be ours the glory of our hands.<sup>19</sup>

Is not the world of ideas in Schiller's poems, as presented by these mixed and lingering sounds, grown from Jewish earth? Aren't these Jewish views that live in and are woven into the fabric? Aren't the fol-

lowing notions blooms picked from the Jewish tree of life, except that he uses different terms to describe them: the serene view of life's destiny, the joy found through the happy perception of having fulfilled life's destiny before God, the appreciation of God as Almighty in the temple of nature, the sanctity of the home and the great importance of woman—of the home within the wife and the wife in the home, the State's constitution based on law and liberty, and on liberty within the law, the divine equality of each human being divinely born, an equality in nobleness and value, and the dignity of each human life that is consecrated to God. Aren't these the seeds of God's legacy as cultivated in Judaism on behalf of humanity for thousands of years, that continually keep growing in the heart of humanity, consciously and unconsciously, and bring about its enlightenment and refinement?

That is why the wisdom of our fathers has taught us to look for "wisdom imparted by God" through the mouth of the "sages of all nations." Jewish wisdom is awaiting the enlightenment of all minds on earth. Jewish law recognizes only Abraham's sons and daughters as God's appointed ones, the priestly and consecrated torchbearers of the truth that is able to save humanity. However, this truth in itself, this justice, enlightenment, and morality, shall become an inheritance for all on earth to whom God has given breath. God has placed these seeds into the hearts of mortals, and Judaism's rays shall ripen these seeds. That is why Judaism and Jews are awaiting the enlightenment of mankind, and the final and victorious awakening of the humane and the divine in man. This is what they hope for. That is why those who understand how to produce the humane and the divine in man's heart, the poet genius who knows how to set minds aflame for that which is pure, true, and divine, who knows how to make one proud to be a man and who causes him to acknowledge his God in each breath of his being, who pulls man up from the dust and presents him in dignity and nobleness, he is a divine messenger who appears as a herald in the world of men, whose mission our Sages were awaiting.

The Sages welcome as coworkers of man's salvation whoever works to educate mankind, whoever teaches men to be humane and saves them from all barriers that men have built between themselves and the one and only God. Schiller is a noble link in that chain of men who continue teaching humanity in an ever increasing extent, with ever greater success, to be those who do not need any type of mediation between themselves and God, who teach men about the faith in God that everyone can feel in their own heart and can see written on the firmament

with flames of fire. May thus awareness awaken within the circle of men that one can be human without belonging to a certain church, that justice, human dignity and morals are inalienable and guaranteed to everyone, that these are the only victorious powers able to save humanity, and that more and more men should unite in order to pay homage to these eternal goods that won't change over time.

Now we experience that an entire nation, nearly an entire continent, has arisen to praise the memory of a man who did not enrich them with gold or silver, nor with industrial inventions and comforts, and who did not produce material goods. Lacking material goods himself, he hardly knew how to increase the material prosperity of men. They have, however, arisen jubilantly in the awareness of the spiritual goods he bequeathed to them, of the enlightening and morally ennobling songs he sang among them, and whose sound still powerfully inspires them to all that is true and good.

My friends, our Sages would welcome the fact that homage is brought to the spiritual, namely, to the morally ennobling spirit of Schiller, as the break of day, as that dawn when all men some day shall arise and the covers will fall off their eyes entirely, when the minds and souls shall awaken and finally everyone, all over the earth, will understand that man only has to be human in order to live well, to be happy on earth while subject to his Father in heaven who is One.

They would greet with true joy and give homage to the memory of the man who knew how to set alight minds for this respect to virtuosity: ברוך שנתן מחמתו לבשר ודם.

But the Jewish people also have a special right to praise such people. We owe it to spirits such as Schiller that, little by little, Jews are permitted to live like human beings among men, and that, little by little, the privilege and dignity of citizenship is no longer withheld from Jews. Spirits such as Schiller have, above all, effected progress by enlightening people to the sentiments of humanitarianism and justice. This has brought down the narrow gates of the ghetto and has allowed Jews to be welcomed as brothers and to enjoy equal freedom.

Finally, we believe that if schools everywhere are pleased to celebrate a public Schiller Festival, a Jewish school should be even more pleased about such an event.

After all, a Jewish school, and this includes ours as well, is not defined by any material considerations. Our school does not teach more skills than others do when it comes to preparing for future professions, and thus the Jewish school is on equal footing with other schools. A Jewish school is made Jewish based on concepts and patterns of life. If

Schiller had understood these truths, he would, in his Mosaic mission, have discovered atonement for his error. The ideal would have been realized which he so painfully missed in his Greek gods. Had he known Judaism other than through the veil of his birth, Schiller would have been a Jew. He would not have mourned the disappearance of the beautiful Greek era and considered everyday life as bland and lacking attraction and poetry. In this Jewish life, the very ordinary Jewish life, his soul would have discovered the poetry of existence, the ideal of truth, and divine beauty in every breath. He would have walked the earth thrice as blissfully and thrice happier. A Jewish school wants to effectively contribute towards this ideal in life, to turn the ordinary into the divine, to perfect the entire earthly life and its aspirations. The leaders of Jewish educational institutions may oftentimes find it difficult to have to work for intangible goods and goals, and to awaken and enthuse the minds and souls of youths, as all this is considered "impractical" to the spirit of materialism in a century steeped in materialism. Yet now the Jewish school is experiencing a day when the world has arisen, rejoicing and braiding wreaths of homage to the singer of ideals, to the most idealistic poet, to him who sang of human lives and of the meaning of human existence at its most idealistic. Shouldn't therefore the Jewish school be rejoicing, since this relates to their own interests and aspirations?

Were someone to say that all the extra-curricular requirements will not help anyone in producing bread and in improving the material circumstances of the youth, we shall hold up the Schiller Festival to him. We shall show him how millions arose to celebrate the memory of a man who did not contribute to the physical strivings of men and to whom the world owes no thanks for any material enrichment. Rather, he knew how to inspire ideals in his nation. He taught them to love and treasure the ideals of the human heart as the most genuine, eternal, inalienable, and uplifting possessions man can have. Thus, the exulted radiance of the Schiller Festival sheds a modest ray also on the Jewish school, allowing it to happily continue its quiet and modest work on behalf of mankind's holiest possessions.

We have assembled you here, my young friends, especially for this reason. We would very much like to imprint the meaning of this day on your souls, so as to teach you to give thought to the following: How lofty it would be to have been born such a person, one for whom a hundred years later the entire world still rejoices at his birth. How great and how full of wonder and joy it is that this man has captured the gratitude and homage of an entire world!

How has this man earned the gratitude of the world on whose behalf all our contemporaries are celebrating today and tomorrow? Has he enriched people? Did he teach them how to establish grander businesses? Did he invent steam-power or the telegraph? Does he belong among the explorers who sailed the world? On the whole, was he a man who knew how to widen the field of our material endeavors and to enrich our possessions and pleasures? Alas, Schiller was not very good at acquiring goods for himself. He was a poet, and he himself sang of how men who strive for ideals often get the shorter end of the stick in life when it comes to their share of earthly goods!

There have been many in this world who taught people how to enrich themselves and live more comfortable lives, the various ways to get ahead faster and find more enjoyment. There have also been many that revealed the secrets of distant heavens, and of the depths below the earth. So many thinkers, explorers, and inventors have produced brilliant thoughts, inventions, and discoveries. These were magnificent and useful and made our physical lives more comfortable, convenient, and abundant. The world mentions their names with gratefulness, but for none of them are wreaths of gratitude bound, nor does the entire nation arise on their behalf. Schiller receives the wreath from the hands of an entire nation, and why? Because Schiller has given them what is better than money or goods, and is the only thing that can instill earthly goods and possessions with their real value and meaning. He has taught them to aspire to ends wherein earthly goods can be of value for eternity. Schiller taught them how to relate to spiritual goods and lofty thoughts. He understood how to clothe eternal truths in such beautiful forms that men arrive at the love for everything that is true and good based on this beauty. That is the reason why the world is rejoicing and giving him homage.

You see, my dear young friends, we would so much like for this celebration to be fruitful and teach your youthful minds the value of spiritual goods, so that you shall decide to strive for them as Schiller did. By doing so you will remain life-long friends of everything that enlightens the mind and ennobles the heart, and of whatever makes men more humane and civilized and therefore also cheerful and joyful in every possible situation. Such people have an easier time doing without, whether times change for the better or worse. Not all of us can become a Schiller, since centuries pass between the birth of such souls. We can only resemble Schiller through our earnest striving, by not shrinking away from difficulties in life and from whatever kindles our hearts and awakens our souls, and to aspire to the higher goals in life. As our Sages

would say: סוף הכבוד לבוא,<sup>20</sup> that is, honor is solely in the hands of the future. And further, my young friends, on a day such as this may you also take to heart how much a human can achieve when turning his thoughts and energies towards the spiritual and the ethical, and how one single person, without means or possessions and based only on intellectual ability and ennoblement through ethics, can delight and make an entire world so happy that a whole nation can arise one century later and rejoice aloud in jubilation over the fact that such a man has lived, taught, thought, and sung among them.

May we, each within his little circle, learn this and train ourselves from early on. We can thus become competent and brave, so that even if the entire world shall not arise at one time and rejoice and remember us in centuries to come, the small circle in which we live, and shall belong to, and wherein we think, strive, feel, and act, may still arise long, long after we are gone and praise God that He has given a share of wisdom to the mortal who reveres Him, and has opened up such a large field wherein humans can happily strive, and where we all can, and should, participate.

May today be a day of uplifting for great and small. We, the sons of Judaism who are conscious of our own mission, shall celebrate this day with twice as much fervor. We shall rejoice in the thought that what is sung of in one of our oldest Jewish songs remains true today.

אזכיר רהב ובבל וגו' זה ילד שם ולציון יאמר איש ואיש ילד בה וגו'  
ד' יספר בכתוב עמים זה ילד שם סלה, ושרים כחוללים כל מעיני בד.

[Ps. 87:4-7: "If I make mention of Rahab and Babylon . . . this one was born there. But of Zion it can be said: 'Every man was born there . . . ' The Lord counts when he registers peoples: 'This one was born there.' Selah. But singers and masters of the flute alike, all my wellsprings are in thee." ] When God enters the names of the nations into the book of history, he counts the great ones who were born among them: זה ילד שם, this one was born there—Schiller in Marbach, and someone else in another place.<sup>21</sup> ולציון יאמר איש ואיש, But of Zion is can be said: All greatness is born there, everything that truly illuminates and ennoble.<sup>22</sup> ושרים כחוללים in the end flow from the spring, created by God in Zion through the word that enlightens men, which has found its abode there and from there penetrates into the minds of men. כל מעיני בד, Zion is the foremost spring of everything that brings blessings to mankind. Every thought and every experience shall strengthen us and renew our minds and encourage us to draw from this well and to drink from this spring.<sup>23</sup>

We youngsters should move about thoughtfully and cheerfully these days. Once we return again into these halls of our youthful aspirations, we should be accompanied by such jovial earnestness and courageous zeal that will stand the test of time, so that even though one is not handed laurel wreaths as was Schiller, one may deserve beautiful wreaths of life, work, creativity, and endeavor within one's circle. May thus, one day, all of us call ourselves happy that we have lived among those who aspired and struggled for them [i.e., the beautiful wreaths of life, etc.], and walked with them in the earth's valley.

And so, my dear young friends, celebrate these days of this public festival very cheerfully, and learn from the celebration of the great ones what it means to rejoice that שנתן מחמתו לבשר ודם, that God has bestowed a faint resonance, a faint reflection of His wisdom unto mortals on earth, which forever brings us enlightenment, delight, and blessing.

### Notes

1. It appears in Hirsch's *Gesammelte Schriften* (Frankfurt, 1912) vol. 6, pp. 308–21. A preliminary version of the translation that follows was done by Esther Bauer, which I in turn revised.
2. Even a supposed supporter of *Torah im Derekh Erez* such as Leo Levi could assert that Hirsch felt forced to deliver his speech in order that his school not be seen as departing from what was proper. This assumption, of course, says nothing about the content of the speech. Levi even makes the indefensible assertion that Hirsch only “permitted” reading German literature in order to learn the language, “but not in order to know the content”! See *Ha-Ma'ayan* 48 (Nisan 5768): 35, 38 n. 12. It is hard to imagine a greater distortion of Hirsch's legacy than this. Cf. R. Raphael Posen, “La-Ḥazor la-Telem,” *Ha-Ma'ayan* 49 (Nisan 5769): 84 n. 2: “Today it is hard to believe, but this is a fact: My grandfather, R. Gershon Posen, served as a dayan in Adass Jeschurun of Frankfurt for close to fifty years, and assumed this role during R. Samson Raphael Hirsch's lifetime and at his request. He was a student of R. Hirsch in the high school, and regarded him as his master and teacher. However, R. Hirsch did not teach him Humash or Talmud, but the writings of Friedrich Schiller.” As I was completing this article, R. Yisroel Mantel, the current rav of Khal Adath Jeshurun in Washington Heights—which sees itself as the continuation of R. Hirsch's Frankfurt community—made news when he declared that R. Hirsch's *Torah im Derekh Erez* philosophy is no longer a viable approach. This public rejection of *Torah im Derekh Erez* in favor of the yeshiva world's “Torah only” approach was made at his community's 200th birthday celebration for Hirsch. See Elliot Resnick, “Controversial Moments at Rav S. R. Hirsch Memorial Celebration,” *Jewish Press*, June 25, 2008.

[While this article was in press, Dr. Elliot Bondi, senior editor of the Rabbi Dr. Joseph Breuer Foundation, informed Dr. David Shatz, editor of

*The Torah u-Madda Journal*, that a translation of R. Hirsch's "Schiller Speech" was done years ago by Gertrude Hirschler. This translation has never been published. According to Bondi, the reason for this was that in the immediate post-Holocaust era R. Hirsch's praise of German culture made the speech too sensitive for some to read. However, it is planned to include Hirschler's translation in a forthcoming supplemental volume to *The Collected Writings of R. S.R.Hirsch*.]

3. *Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch* (New York, 1996), 285. The relationship of R. Hirsch and Schiller is explored in Alan Brill's forthcoming article, "Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch: Romanticism and Catholic Romanticism."
4. *Modernity Within Tradition: The Social History of Orthodox Jewry in Imperial Germany*, trans. Elizabeth Petuchowski (New York, 1992), 70.
5. See Hirsch's *Collected Writings* (New York, 1992), vol. 7, p. 90: "But there is also a spiritual harvest that can be won from secular studies, even for those who seek to grow in the theoretical knowledge of the Jewish religion. Our understanding of the philosophy of life and the *Weltanschauung* taught in the sacred writings of the Jewish religion is dependent in no small measure on our insights into the character and the development of nature and society."
6. See M. Brann, "Aus H. Graetz's Lehr- und Wanderjahren," *Monatsschrift für Geschichte und Wissenschaft des Judentums* 63 (1919): 352-53.
7. See Breuer, *Modernity Within Tradition*, 83-84.
8. In 1905, Hirsch's grandson, R. Raphael Breuer, went so far as to state: "Truly, if Hedwig Tell and Gertrud Stauffacher [figures in Schiller's *William Tell*] only had Sabbath lights, Schiller would have created the idealized portrait of Jewish housewives!" See *ibid.*, pp. 83, 423, n. 145. On Raphael Breuer's unsuccessful bid to become rabbi of the Hirschian community of Frankfurt, see my "Ha-Mahaloket al ha-Rabbanut be-Frankfurt: Mabbat mi-Bifnim," *Milín Havivin* 3 (2007):26-33.
9. See Abraham Atkin, *The Beth Jacob Movement in Poland (1917-1939)* (unpublished doctoral dissertation, Yeshiva University, 1959), 78. Deutschlander also included Goethe, which is to be expected considering that he wrote a book entitled *Goethe und das Alte Testament* (Frankfurt, 1923).
10. Male and female senior students, teachers, the government inspector of schools and the school board, and as large an audience as the space permitted were assembled in a festively decorated and illuminated room at the school. Male and female students recited corresponding passages from Schiller's poems and dramas, and alternately sang songs. [This note appears in the text. Girls were permitted to sing at Hirsch's Frankfurt school; see Breuer, *Modernity Within Tradition*, 411, n. 11, who calls attention to a report in *Jeschurun* 18 (1885): 11, of a public function at the school at which a teenage girl sang in the presence of a crowded audience. See also my *Between the Yeshiva World and Modern Orthodoxy* (Oxford, 1999), p. 216.]
11. See *Berakhot* 58a: "Our Rabbis taught: On seeing the Sages of Israel one should say: 'Blessed be He who hath imparted of His wisdom to them that fear Him.' On seeing the sages of other nations, one says, 'Blessed be He who hath imparted of His wisdom to His mortals.'"
12. "An die Freude," translation in *The Works of Frederick Schiller* (New York, 1895), 69ff. All Schiller translations are taken from this book, and the page number is given following the German title.
13. "Hymne an den Unendlichen," 351.

- 
14. "Die Künstler," 82.
  15. "Das Höchste," 298.
  16. "Resignation," 80.
  17. "Die Worte des Glaubens," 261.
  18. "Würde der Frauen," 238.
  19. "Das Lied von der Glocke," 223ff.
  20. *Nedarim* 62a.
  21. In his commentary to Psalms, *ad loc.*, Hirsch writes: "The great men of other nations who have labored for the welfare of their own peoples are also listed in God's world register, and their birthplaces are recorded there. However, there are only a very few to be recorded from each nation." See *The Hirsch Psalms*, trans. Gertrude Hirschler (New York, 1978).
  22. In his commentary to Psalms, R. Hirsch writes:

But of Zion it can be said: "Every one worthy of mention was born here. Zion is the mother of every great spirit that has ever lived and worked in Israel. Indeed, today we can say of all the great spirits that have labored for the true education and enlightenment of mankind even beyond the confines of Israel that, whether they know it or not, their spiritual cradle stood in Zion. It was sparks from the Word of Zion that inspired their spirits and emotions and consecrated them to be God's messengers among mankind."
  23. In his commentary to Psalms, R. Hirsch writes: "But masters of song and instrument alike, כל מעיני, all things spiritual that emanate from me or for me, בך, have their origin in Thee."